


A Qualitative Approach on Nurse Turnover Intention of Private Hospitals in Cileungsi, Indonesia

Dianingsih Maryanti¹, Nofi Erni², Rina Mutiara³

Universitas Esa Unggul, Jakarta Barat

Article information	Abstract
<p>Article history: Received: May 05th, 2023 Revised: June 05th, 2023 Accepted: June 15th, 2023</p> <p>Corresponding author: Name: Nofi Erni Address: Jalan Arjuna Utara No.9, Kebon Jeruk, Jakarta 11510 E-mail: nofi.erni@esaunggul.ac.id</p> <p>International Journal of Nursing and Health Services (IJNHS), Volume 6, Issue 3, June 20th, 2023 DOI: 10.35654/ijnhs.v6i3.722 E-ISSN: 2654-6310</p>	<p>Background: Turnover is one of the human resources risks that hospital management should address to maintain the number of nurses at private hospitals. Objective: This study aims to explore factors that influence the turnover intention of nurses in private hospitals in Cilengsih, Indonesia. Method: A qualitative phenomenological approach was applied in this study. Ten informants were selected using a purposive sampling technique based on inclusion criteria. Result: The results of the study show that the causes of nurse turnover intention are such as 1) a high gap in salary among nurses who have worked for a long time with new nurses; 2) Nurse's attitude and characteristics; 3) conflicts with colleagues or family; and 4) A better offer than other places or competing hospitals. Conclusion: This study concludes that four factors cause high nurse turnover in private hospitals. Recommendation: Hospital management must carry out workload analysis, career management, and nurse job satisfaction to prevent high nurse turnover.</p> <p>Keywords: risk management, human resource management, nurse turnover intention</p>
	<p>This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License CC BY -4.0</p>

Background

Turnover intention becomes a crucial problem in an organization. High nurse turnover could affect the quality of service to patients and disrupt the sustainability of an organization or hospital (1). Nurse turnover is affected by nurse welfare, nursing quality standards that are too high, and the payroll system.

A study revealed the cause of nurse turnover, such as the organization's internal environment (2). In addition, stress caused by misplacement of staff, leadership style, poor relationship with supervisors, limited promotion opportunities, and inflexible administrative policies would encourage turnover (3).

A previous explained that PTSD (Post Traumatic Stress Disorders), depression, anxiety disorders, and excessive fatigue (burnout) positively affect the desire to quit (4). Another study confirmed that turnover below 10% is considered low, but above 10% can be detrimental to an organization. Therefore, the hospital is expected to be able to maintain nursing staff by reducing turnover intention (5).

A quantitative study of 111 nurses in Alabama, United States, showed the issue of nurse turnover intention associated with stress due to job demands, supervisor support, adequacy of personal protective equipment for nurses, psychosocial support, and compensation (6). Excessive workload causes burnout

Although many studies have been conducted in various countries related to the issue of turnover intention, only some studies in Indonesia have explored the real causes of turnover intention for nurses in private hospitals. However, it is essential to explore this qualitatively to ascertain the cause.

This study qualitatively describes the factors that cause nurses to have a turnover intention from the hospital. This study is based on the increasing nurse turnover rate from 10% in 2020 to 16% in 2021. In addition, more female nurses who

resign with an age range of under 30 years with a length of service of under two years are more likely to quit.

OBJECTIVE

The study aimed to explore the determinants of turnover intention for nurses at private hospitals in Indonesia.

METHOD

Design

This study uses a qualitative design with a phenomenological approach to explaining turnover issues in private hospitals. This study was conducted at a private hospital in Cilengsih, Indonesia.

Informants

Ten informants were selected using the purposive sampling technique based on the inclusion criteria. The key informants consisted of Human Resources, training section staff, the Head of a service unit consisting of the Head of Nursing, Head of Risk Management, Head of Outpatient Unit, Head of Emergency Unit, Head of the Sapphire Unit, Head of Diamond Unit, and Head of Hemodialysis Unit. We selected all heads of departments since we explored the information based on their perspective on turnover intention among nurses.

Data collection process

The in-depth interviews and FGDs were conducted using a semi-structured interview, with open-ended questions following an interview guideline, based on the main themes and sub-themes, to explore the determinants of turnover intention for nurses at private hospitals in Indonesia. Each interview took place at a hospital for approximately 60 to 90 minutes. All interviews were audiotape recorded and transcribed by the interviewer and research assistant. The interview guidelines were classified into four sub-groups of key informants. The observation was done directly by a researcher at the hospital.

The instrument for data collection

We used the interview guidelines and notes for data collecting information. Before the research was conducted, two experts checked the interview guidelines and pilot-testing to ensure the content of the interview guidelines.

Data analysis

We transcribed and translated the data from an audio recorder. After collecting data, researchers underwent a data reduction process to identify the main themes and sub-themes. Thematic analysis was done to identify themes within the local context. Parallel techniques to extract key themes and sub-themes were done by two researchers in order to make a consensus agreement of the findings.

RESULT

Determinant of Nurse Turnover Intention

1) High gap in salary among nurses who have worked for a long time with new nurses

Salary is the most essential element in retaining employees in a company. This study found that salary issues were the decisive factor associated with turnover intention besides the work environment. Another respondent confirmed that employee salaries are still below compared to surrounding hospitals. A respondent also described salary or reward becomes a predictor for nurses who have worked for a long time. Whereas fresh graduates who are only looking for work experience

"The causal factor is usually besides the work environment is the issue of salary (Mrs. DK, 29 years old)

"The causative factors are usually salary and being away from family." (Mr. S, 47 years old)

"Because the salary of employees is still below that of the surrounding hospitals and the distance between the house and

the hospital is too far." (Mr. TS, 29 years old).

"The most common cause is salary, so they decide to resign." (Mr. R, 42 years old).

"The reason is salary, rewards, and fresh graduates only looking for work experience" (Mrs. DA, 35 years).

2) Personal attitude and characteristics of nurses

Personal attitudes and characteristics of nurses become the second theme associated with turnover intention among nurses. Some respondents explored their attitudes and feelings of being unable to work. Another respondent also explained that Individual attitudes, nurse satisfaction, and organizational commitment become the factors associated with turnover intention. The age factor that causes fatigue is also a reason for the turnover of nurses.

the feeling of not being able to finish work, the attitude and characteristics of nurses to be loyal to the hospital." (Mrs. R, 35 years)

"Individual attitudes, nurse satisfaction, and commitment to the organization." (Mrs. D, 33 years).

"age factor that causes fatigue is also a reason for turnover from nurses." (Mrs. NH, 39 years)

3) Conflicts with colleagues or family

Conflict at work is one of the decisive factors that cause turnover intention among nurses. This is because the work environment could be more conducive. Three informants said that conflict with co-workers and family caused the nurse's turnover intention to arise. Another respondent confirmed that unsupportive co-workers and internal conflicts become the determinant factor of

turnover among nurses from a private hospital.

"Conflict at work causes an uncondusive environment that makes nurses resign."(Mrs.DK,29 years old)

"conflict with colleagues and family can make nurses uncomfortable at work."(Mrs.R,35 years old).

"unsupportive co-workers and internal conflicts." (Mrs.R, 42 years).

4) A better offer than other places or competing hospitals

Better offers from other organizations and career opportunities elsewhere make nurses consider moving jobs. This aligns with what was expressed by two informants that there is a better offer for individual nurses, such as promotions or facilities. Job satisfaction, rewards, and other organizational commitments to their careers become determinants. Another respondent also explained that rewards, better offers than competing hospitals, and boredom with daily work are the considerations for nurses to change jobs.

"better offers, job satisfaction, rewards, and other organizational commitments to his career become determinants." (Mrs. D, 33 years).

"Rewards, better offers than competing hospitals and boredom with daily work." (Mrs. DK, 40 years).

DISCUSSION

Salary is essential in maintaining the continuity of human resources in an organization. This study found that the salary factor is one of the causes of turnover intention by nurses. The existence of a gap or difference in salary between new nurses who earn a higher salary than old nurses is a determining factor. This is

because there is a regulation from the center regarding new nurses whose salaries are adjusted to the applicable city minimum wage. Even though there is a regular salary increase every two years for all appropriate employees. Thus, some nurses resigned and moved to another, more promising place. This is in line with a study that stated that work motivation plays a vital role in the development of organizations, as it increases employee productivity and effectiveness (7). Other research also explains that salary is a factor that can increase individual motivation to work and maintain oneself in an organization (8).

Personal attitudes and characteristics of nurses become the second theme associated with turnover intention among nurses. The personal attitude and feelings of being unable to work were associated with turnover intention (9). It was consistent with a previous study that confirmed that effective commitment was a decisive factor in turnover intention (10). Other study described how personal factors and characteristics of nurses become considerations for nurses to change jobs and deciding to resign (11-12)

Conflict at work is one of the strong factors that cause turnover intention among nurses. Dramatically conflict in the workplace makes the work environment not conducive. Thereby, unsupportive co-workers and internal conflicts become the determinant factor of turnover among nurses. The findings of this study also confirmed that similar situations in conflict with co-workers and unsupportive caused nurse turnover intention to arise. It was consistent with a previous study describing the role of internal conflict and support between colleges influence the turnover intention (13). Another study described the effect of conflict at the workplace on nurses to change jobs and decide to resign (14-15)

Better offers from other organizations and career opportunities elsewhere make nurses consider moving jobs. Job satisfaction, rewards, and other

organizational commitments to their careers become another determinant for nurses to decide to resign and consider changing jobs for nurses. This is in line with a study that stated that better offers from other organizations and career opportunities elsewhere are factors that increase individual motivation to work and maintain oneself in an organization (16). Other research also explains the role of organizational commitment to preventing turnover due to better offers from other organizations and career opportunities elsewhere (17-18)

Conclusion

This study concludes that four determinant factors become the solid factors for influencing the turnover intention from their job. Management needs to consider those factors to maintain human resources. They should also prevent the turnover intention among nurses at a private hospitals.

Recommendation

As a result, decreased motivation causes turnover intention. Hospital management should be able to pay attention to the needs of nurses to increase job satisfaction. Measurement of job satisfaction can be carried out by hospital management through a survey of all nurses. Coping management training for service unit heads and team leaders to be able to provide support to nurses in dealing with work-related stress and conflicts with colleagues or family. Hospital management conducts workload analysis training with all unit heads. Therefore, they can carry out workload calculations in their respective units. Hospital management needs to improve the nurse's career path guidelines and rearrange the compensation structure according to the competency level of nurses and service units.

References

1. Dewanto A, Wardhani V. Nurse turnover and perceived causes and

consequences: a preliminary study at private hospitals in Indonesia. *BMC Nurs.* 2018; 17 (Suppl 2), 52.

<https://doi.org/10.1186/s12912-018-0317-8>

2. Arifah Nurul, Triharini M, Wahyudi AS. "Analysis of External and Internal Factors of Nurse Turnover: A Systematic Review." *Jurnal Kesehatan Dr. Soebandi.* 2021; 9(2): 67-78, doi:[10.36858/jkds.v9i2.312](https://doi.org/10.36858/jkds.v9i2.312)
3. Aiken L. Nurse Reports On Hospital In Five Countries. *Health Affairs.* 2001; 20(3): 43-53.
4. Ohue T, Togo E, Ohue Y, Mitoku K. The mental health of nurses involved with COVID-19 patients in Japan, intention to resign, and influencing factors. *Medicine.* 2021; 100(31), e26828. <https://doi.org/10.1097/MD.00000000000026828>
5. Sorenson S. How Employee Engagement Drives Growth. *Gallup Business Journal.* (2013): 41-44
6. Cole A, Ali H, Ahmed A, Hamasha M, Jordan S. Identifying patterns of turnover intention among Alabama frontline nurses in hospital settings during the covid-19 pandemic. *Journal of Multidisciplinary Healthcare.* 2021; 14: 1783-1794. <https://doi.org/10.2147/JMDH.S308397>
7. Vo TTD, Tuliao KV, Chen CW. Work Motivation: The Roles of Individual Needs and Social Conditions. *Behav Sci (Basel).* 2022;12(2):49
8. Tan TL, Anh PVT, Nhu PNP, Thu TTA, Tuan VDA, Hung HN. Research factors affecting the working motivation of employees at accomodation facilities in Danang. *International Journal of Marketing & Human Resources Research.* 2021; 2(4): 236-264
9. Shukla A, Raghavan S, Dhir S. Impact of work related attitudes on turnover intention. *Indian Journal of Industrial relation.* 2013; 49 (1): 111-122
10. Rashad DM, Rosari R. The impact of burnout toward affective commitment

and turnover intention. *Jurnal siasat bisnis*. 2020; 24(1): 18-33

<https://doi.org/10.1186/s11782-020-00074-6>

11. Tei-Tominaga, M. Factors related to the intention to leave and the decision to resign among newly graduated nurses: a complete survey in a selected prefecture in Japan. *Environ Health Prev Med*. 2013; 18: 293-305
12. Albougami AS, Almazan JU, Cruz JP, Alquwez N, Alamri MS, Adolfo CA, Roque MY. Factors affecting nurses' intention to leave their current jobs in Saudi Arabia. *Int J Health Sci (Qassim)*. 2020;14(3):33-40
13. Kashif MF, Israr S. Relationship between work-family conflict and turnover intention of University Teacher in Lahore. 2020; 5(3): 117-123
14. Blanco-Donoso LM, Moreno-Jiménez J, Hernández-Hurtado M, Cifri-Gavela JL, Jacobs S, Garrosa E. Daily Work-Family Conflict and Burnout to Explain the Leaving Intentions and Vitality Levels of Healthcare Workers: Interactive Effects Using an Experience-Sampling Method. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*. 2021;18(4):1932
15. Awan FH, Dunnan L, Jamil K, Gul RF, Anwar A, Indrees M, Guangyu Q. Impact of role conflict on intention to leave job with the moderating role of job embeddness in banking sector employees. *Front. Psychol*. 2021; 12
16. Setyawati NW, Woelandari DS, Rianto RM. Career deveopment, motivation. and promotion on employee performance. *East Asian Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*. 2022; 1(9): 1957-1970
17. Al Balushi AK, Thumiki VRR, Nawaz N, Jurcic A, Gajenderan V. Role of organizational commitment in career growth and turnover intention in public sector of Oman. *PLOS ONE*. 2022; 17(5): e0265535
18. Wang Q, Wang C. Reducing turnover intention: perceived organizational support for frontline employees. *Front. Bus. Res. China*. 2020: 14 (6).